

STATE OF CALIFORNIA
Department of Industrial Relations
Division of Occupational Safety and Health

Date: October 9, 2011

To: Ellen Widess, Chief

From: Garrett Brown and Peter Riley

Re: Listening Tour – Final Report

The following is a summary report from one-on-one interviews with 374 DOSH staff members – headquarter staff, office managers, field inspectors and consultants, and office administrative personnel – conducted in May and June 2011 by Garrett Brown, compliance officer in the Oakland District Office, and Peter Riley, District Manager of the High Hazard Unit – South office in Santa Ana. These interviews, averaging 25-30 minutes in length, made up the six-week “Listening Tour” initiated by Chief Ellen Widess as part of her transition of leadership in the Division.

This report consists of several sections: the key findings of Brown and Riley based on our interviews; the key recommendations and suggestions made by DOSH staff during the interviews for changes in Division-wide policies and practices; and two appendices of Division-wide issues and issues in specific offices and work units throughout the state.

Main Report: pages 1-14

Appendix 1 (Division-wide issues): pages 15-23

Appendix 2 (Specific work unit issues): pages 24-34

The most significant findings and recommendations occur in five areas highlighted below – communications; internal atmosphere; accountability; organizational structure; and policies and procedures. Suggestions and recommendations from DOSH staff for many other aspects of the Division’s work are summarized in the appendices.

A key recommendation from interviewers Brown and Riley is that DOSH Headquarters create a formal “Working Group” to follow-up this report and implement as many of the following ideas and recommendations as are financially and organizationally feasible and desirable. The Working Group should have a finite time line for its follow-up work and issue a final report of its own at the completion of its term.

KEY FINDINGS

Many of the findings and recommendations in this report are longstanding issues within the Division, going as far back as the “disengagement” and “reengagement” processes at the end of the 1980s. In 1999, then Chief Dr. John Howard responded to a letter from

DOSH staff concerned about the Division's functioning by establishing "EGIP," the "Employee Generated Improvement Project," which resulted in a series of staff focus-group meetings, and a report containing many of the same issues raised below. Similar concerns were identified in a second EGIP-style process and report, coordinated by representatives of CAPS (California Association of Professional Scientists) and PECG (Professional Engineers in California Government) in 2002.

The key underlying factor of the issues identified below is a lack of resources (financial, human and technical), and without additional resources it will be difficult, if not impossible, to make significant progress in correcting deficiencies in the Division.

The Division is no longer funded from the state's General Fund, but rather by a combination of Federal OSHA grants and a surcharge on California employers' workers compensation premiums. This independent funding will "sunset" in July 2013 unless renewed.

In theory, this funding mechanism should not be affected by the status of California's budget, but political considerations over the last several administrations have left the agency significantly under-resourced and under-staffed since "re-engagement" in 1989.

In April 2011, the Division had the same number of field compliance officers (196) as it did in April 1994 – despite an 18% growth in the state's workforce (2.8 million workers) during the same time period. Moreover, there are currently critical vacancies throughout the Division – field personnel, administrative staff, managers, and legal and medical professionals – which must be addressed if lasting solutions for the deficiencies described below are to be implemented.

An inspiring aspect of the interviews we conducted was the large number of DOSH employees, especially field personnel and administrative staff, who take their jobs seriously and work hard to meet the Division's mission and legal mandate in spite of the many limitations and difficulties. DOSH employees at all levels are committed to, and draw satisfaction from, "making a difference" in preventing injuries and saving lives, and "being a catalyst for positive change" in workplaces throughout the state.

This dedicated workforce is clearly the most important asset and resource the Division has at its command. Ensuring that this asset is able to perform at its highest potential – with the resources, support and training DOSH staff need to do their job – is the most effective way state government can protect worker health and safety in California.

To that end, the Listening Tour interviews indicated serious short-comings in five key areas that should be at the center of the Division's internal corrective action plan – communications; internal atmosphere; accountability; organizational structure; and policies and practices.

While some organizational issues are insurmountable without additional resources, many issues below can be effectively addressed by revised policies and pro-active leadership at

all levels of the Division. Reinvigorated leadership has no cost associated with it, and key policy revisions can be implemented in a deliberate step-by-step manner in the coming months.

Communications. By far the largest concern of DOSH staff was the lack of effective communications between different levels, as well as between different offices at the same level of the organization. DOSH staff at almost all levels indicated they have not been involved in, or even informed of, the deliberations and decisions made by Headquarters staff, despite the impact these activities have on DOSH offices and personnel. Many interviewed employees felt that Headquarters had “no idea” of what their unit does and the challenges it faces, had not made any effort to find out, and this lack of information contributed to decisions made at HQ that are often unworkable or counterproductive.

In addition, many interviewed staff felt there was a lack of communications between units at the same level, both in compliance and consultation, which prevent the sharing of useful information and experiences, and which result in markedly different policies and practices on the same issue within the Division.

Overall, most interviewed staff felt there has been no consistent and effective explanation from Headquarters of the Division’s mission, overall goals and objectives, and the short-, medium- and long-term plans to reach these goals. Many staff reported feeling as if their particular work unit, and even themselves personally, are “on their own” trying to figure out how best to determine and implement the Division’s policies and, most importantly, protect workers on the job.

Internal atmosphere. Perhaps the most corrosive belief revealed in the interviews was the widespread opinion of staff throughout the Division that they are routinely treated with disrespect, severely criticized, and almost never supported or appreciated by managers and staff at higher levels in the organizational structure. That is, district office personnel felt this way about regional and headquarters staff; regional staff felt this way about headquarters staff, while simultaneously feeling they are distrusted and disrespected by district level personnel.

Interviewed staff reported they felt a lack of confidence in them from higher levels that resulted in “micro-managing” from above, paradoxically at the same time lower levels are blamed, or abandoned altogether, whenever problems develop. Interactions with regional and HQ staff were described as “almost always negative, accusatory and fault-finding,” to the point that “good” managers were described as those “who protect their staff from what comes raining down on us from above.”

In addition to lack of positive feed-back, supportive and professional interactions, many interviewed employees described an atmosphere of constant “crisis management” at higher levels, indicating a lack of planning at region or headquarters that results in disruptive “wild goose chases” or frequent “by the end of business today” emergencies.

Accountability. A frequently offered opinion at all levels of the organization was the belief that “there is no recognition or reward for good work, and no consequences for bad work, or work that not’s done at all.” Many interviewed employees said that “competent, hard-working” staff are perversely “rewarded” with extra work and expectations, while “incompetent or lazy” staff are assigned less work and “allowed to coast.”

The common theme for correcting this imbalance was to “establish real accountability” throughout the organization – staff should be empowered and supported to do their job while also held accountable for their assigned tasks with consequences for poor performance. The consequences, according to many interviewed staff, should be consistent, ongoing efforts to improve the employee’s performance – rather than just long-delayed efforts to terminate the DOSH employee.

Interviewed employees also said the Division needs to hire capable people who have a genuine commitment to our mission, and then actually evaluate employees at the end of their probationary periods (both new and promoted), including rejecting under-performing employees rather than simply “passing everyone along.”

Another widespread concern emerging from the interviews was an “unequal assignment” of work in offices. Employees felt that both field and administrative tasks should be “standardized within offices so that everyone does their fair share.” In particular, field personnel wanted a “fair assignment of big cases” (fatalities, major accidents, high-profile inspections) that typically result in more scrutiny, intense work and time pressures during the inspection, and then the greater likelihood of appeals-related work later on.

Organizational deficiencies. The overwhelming concern of interviewed employees was the understaffing and critical vacancies throughout the Division, including administrative staff, attorneys and medial personnel as well as field personnel and managers. Vacant cubicles can cripple the ability of an office to function, no matter how dedicated the remaining staff are. In addition, some job classifications – such as senior safety engineers – were viewed as being misused or under-utilized; while administrative staff universally decried the lack of a career path and promotional opportunities for them within the Division.

A widely noted deficiency in the interviews was the lack of consistent mentoring of new employees and those promoted to managerial positions. These staff members rarely receive training prior to or immediately after their appointment and are not assigned ongoing mentoring or technical assistance. As one interviewee said, “they are basically thrown into the deep end and have to fend for themselves, which is bad for everyone in the office.”

The lack of professional training (until recently), especially the near-zero training of any kind for administrative personnel, was frequently noted in interviews. Many staff reported severe and ongoing problems getting equipment and services from the CALICO lab. Problems were widely reported related to the lack of technical resources, as well as the lack of electronic resources such as specific software programs and equipment.

Key policies, ostensibly generated by Headquarters, concerning individual and office performance metrics (production quotas, citation type quotas, inspection opening time, case lapse time) were reported to be extremely variable within different DOSH units. These production quotas (which officially do not exist, but do in practice) and short lapse time deadlines actually undercut the Division's ability to protect workers as rushed, *pro forma* inspections are not capable of effectively identifying, characterizing and correcting the full range of hazards in the workplace, especially health-related hazards.

Many interviewed staff described highly centralized compliance case review policies – combined with extensive delays at the regional and headquarters levels – and Division-wide reporting requirements (daily, week-ahead, month-ahead) – combined with lack of communication and coordination among those requesting this information – as highly inefficient practices that also undermine the Division's effectiveness.

As indicated below, interviewed staff had many other concerns and suggestions regarding the Division's operations beyond the five general categories above. Nonetheless, these issues were at the center of every interview conducted during the tour, and will necessarily be at the center of efforts to improve the effectiveness of the agency and the morale of the employees charging with protecting the health and safety of California's workers.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

Communications

- The Chief, Deputy Chiefs and Regional Managers should regularly visit DOSH offices throughout the state;
- Establish regular sequence of staff meetings starting with Headquarters staff meetings with regional managers and unit managers; to regional manager meetings with their district managers; and district manager meetings with staff – all on a monthly cycle;
- Conduct an annual meeting of headquarters staff, regional managers and district managers to review the Division's mission, strategy, goals and objectives;
- Conduct annual meetings (one in the north and one in the south) of all DOSH field personnel (including both compliance and consultation) with a half-day devoted to policy updates, and a half-day of professional conference-style presentations on specific issues or hazards and particularly effective inspections;
- Conduct annual meetings (one in the north and one in the south) of all DOSH administrative personnel with a half-day devoted to policy updates, and a half-day of professional conference-style presentations on specific issues and particularly effective office management practices;
- Conduct one-hour webinars, every month or every other month, for all DOSH staff with updates on organizational policies, new regulations or new initiatives;
- Establish a weekly memo or newsletter from headquarters on activities, deliberations and new policies;

- Establish a quarterly internal DOSH newsletter highlighting the work and successes of various work units, “star performers,” reconfirming goals and the mission;
- Renew office subscriptions to the *Cal/OSHA Reporter*;
- Generate a list of “who’s who” (with names, phone numbers and areas of responsibility) in Headquarters, and in the related DOSH/DIR personnel, facility and technology offices;
- Provide the district managers with copies of the “Daily Report” so they can learn what other offices are doing and better share experiences and exchange information about common employers, industries and inspections;
- Establish an electronic, Division-wide “suggestion box” so DOSH staff can submit ideas, suggestions and concerns directly to headquarters;
- Establish an internal electronic “chat room” so DOSH staff can better share experiences and exchange information about common employers, industries and inspections;
- Headquarters should follow the chain of command in communications with the field, at a minimum copying regional and district managers in all communications with CSHOs and consultants; likewise, at a minimum, copying regional staff on communications with district managers;

Internal atmosphere

- Headquarters should set a new tone of respect, courtesy and mutual support, recognition and appreciation of good work, professionalism within the Division; work constantly to spread this new tone throughout the organization, from top to bottom;
- Headquarters should work to develop an esprit de corps based mutual support for the important mission of the Division, mutual support among all units to achieve that mission, and recognition of milestones and individual and unit accomplishments;
- Headquarters should take advantage of existing state-sponsored employee recognition awards, and/or develop its own set of employee awards;
- Necessary criticism should be done in a respectful and constructive manner;
- Headquarters should move towards eliminating – as possible – the “crisis management style” that has characterized the Division in recent years ; with more planning (medium and long term) the Division can avoid inefficient and ineffective last-minute decisions, “wild goose chases” and “COB today” emergencies;
- Headquarters needs to establish throughout the Division standardized policies related to telecommuting, alternative work schedules, state car assignment and home storage permission, promotions, criteria and approval of admin personnel becoming field inspections (safety techs) – inconsistent application of these policies by regional and district managers generates considerable staff unhappiness, charges of “favoritism” and discrimination;
- The Division should have an all-DOSH summer picnic or Christmas party – north and south if not state-wide;

Accountability

- Headquarters should do less “micro-managing” from above – empower managers and staff down the chain to do their jobs, and then hold them accountable if performance failures occur;
- Performance failures should be dealt with soon after they occur, and HQ response should be to work with staff to identify causes of poor performance and address these underlying causes – last-minute disciplinary action after lengthy delays in acknowledging poor performance should not be the standard response;
- Standardize a “fair distribution” of work within offices (complaints, accidents, fatalities,” high profile” cases, permits, duty days) and avoid “unfair favoritism” in the approval of length of breaks, vacation scheduling, home storage of state cars, etc.;
- Managers should conduct genuine evaluations of new hires and promoted employees during and at the end of probationary periods – under-performing employees should not be automatically “passed on;” probation evaluations should involve more than one person (immediate supervisor) so a more rounded view of the probationary employee can be gleaned by involving senior safety engineers, regional managers, program staff;
- Managers at all levels should use the “same yardstick” in evaluating employee performance so that all individuals’ performance is judged against the same criteria and results in the same set of responses by managers;
- CSHO “rainbow reports” and office SAMMS reports should be used as a starting point of the discussion rather than the endpoint of a “numbers game” – the real question is what is the root cause(s) of low numbers on an individual and work unit performance reports;
- Headquarters should set the example of efficient work practices by rapidly doing case reviews of major cases sent to HQ, acting on Form 9s sent to HQ;
- Headquarters should adopt the “management by walking around and talking to people” method where HQ and regional staff regularly visit work units at various levels and locales within DOSH;
- DOSH should conduct regular overall evaluations of the Division’s own effectiveness to determine what is working, what is not working, what changes are needed;

Organizational structure

Key vacancies

- Deputy Chief of Health [filled after the Listening Tour interviews];
- Attorneys in both north and south Legal Units;
- Legal Secretaries in both north and south Legal Unit;
- Medical Unit personnel (MD, toxicologist, epidemiologist);
- Permanent Principal Engineer for R&S/Safety;
- Field inspectors, especially multi-lingual inspectors;
- District Managers in Compliance;
- Regional Manager and Area Managers in Consultation;

- Administrative staff in district and area offices;
- Administrative personnel in Headquarters budget and procurement;
- Graphic designer for Consultation Research & Education Unit;
- SQL programmer for HHU (to get workers comp data for inspection targeting);

Role of seniors

- Regional seniors should spend less time on administrative tasks at a regional level and more time providing services to field offices – such as partnering with District Office CSHOs on major inspections, providing technical assistance to CSHOs and consultants, providing ongoing hands-on mentoring, accompany CSHOs and consultants during inspections, case review assistance to district and area managers, “mini-trainings” with district and area staff;
- Alternative suggestions for assignment and supervision of senior safety engineers were proposed:
 - o Seniors could be assigned to regional offices but tasked to “service” specific district or area offices; these seniors should attend district and area office staff meetings;
 - o Seniors assigned to specific district and area offices, not to regional offices;
 - o Seniors should all be assigned to Research & Standards and be available state-wide based on their areas of expertise and experience
- Seniors’ role in disciplinary actions with CSHOs and consultants should be strictly limited or eliminated altogether as these tasks undermine the trust field staff have in the seniors;

Role of regions

- Headquarters should review the number, objectives and activities of regional offices; there is a wide divergence of opinion as to whether the current structure and activities help or hinder the district offices;
- If regions are maintained, then their function should be to support the district and area offices; the RMs should regularly visit the district and area offices;

Administrative staff issues

- No career path exists for OA and OT positions; essentially the OT classification is the top of the ladder;
- DOSH should formally re-evaluate the administrative job classifications to provide for a career/promotion path to other administrative classifications (such as MST, SSA, AGPA, SSM, etc) based on the actual work and skills required in the Division;
- DOSH should consider, in the meantime, creating “deep class” for the OT position which could provide additional pay;

Other organizational structure suggestions

- Headquarters should review current structure for “span of control” issues where managers have too many people to effectively supervise (the accepted span of control limit is no more than 7 people);

- Establish an “Assistant DM/AM” in large field offices to share the management work load and develop the “next” manager’s skills;
- Hire a paralegal for the compliance regions or district offices to assist with the appeals preparation (appeal and FOIA document requests, generating exhibits, preparing CSHOs and other witnesses, etc.) and conduct hearings currently done by DMs or CSHOs;
- Hire retired annuitants to assist District Offices prepare for and even conduct appeal hearings, such as working with CSHOs and other witnesses, and preparing documents;
- Reestablish the HQ “Program Office” which would include supervision of the IMIS coordinators;
- Establish the Bakersfield office as soon as possible; three CSHOs already live in Bakersfield; functioning District Office will relieve Fresno and Van Nuys of cases in Kern County; the full-service district office can/should do more than just agriculture, such as fatalities, accident and complaint inspections in general industry; need to establish who will cover Kern County petroleum-related plants (PSM or District Office);
- Establish a Legal Unit office in Fresno or Bakersfield to handle appeals from the southern Central Valley ;
- Abolish or reorganize CALICO (see section below);
- Eliminate the DOSH Technology unit and refer directly to DIR counterparts;
- Combine West Covina and Monrovia district offices;
- Establish a rotation, or facilitate transfer, of CSHOs between DOSH units, especially in “high stress” units such as EEEEC, and between compliance and consultation;
- Establish a separate, self-funded “Tower Crane” unit; alternative suggestions were offered about DOSH personnel doing the inspections directly, or simply certifying and auditing independent certified crane inspectors;
- Eliminate indirect telephone answering where callers have to go through an electronic “tree” before speaking with a human being (such as Foster City, San Bernardino, San Diego and West Covina); DOSH offices should all offer direct interaction with real human beings;

Policies and procedures in the Division

Performance metrics issues

- Recognize and address the reality that there are de facto production quotas, deadlines for opening and closing inspections, number and classification of citations throughout the Division, and these quotas/deadlines vary widely within DOSH, for example – EEEEC units have 120+ inspection quotas and 45-day case lapse time deadline; HHU units have 50 inspection quotas and 65-day case lapse time deadline; many District Offices have 50-70 inspection quotas and 45-day, 60-day or 90-day case lapse time deadlines; Consultation offices have a 20-day report writing deadline;
- High production quotas and short case lapse time (legal deadline is 180 days) limit the time available for thorough inspections, virtually eliminate time needed

- for industrial hygiene sampling, reduce the number of health hazards evaluated (as more time required for health inspections); and reduce the time available for formal and informal consultation with employers;
- “Numbers” do not accurately reflect the quality or even the quantity of the work completed by field personnel; some DOSH units (Fresno Consultation) have developed different performance metrics;
 - DOSH should move away from “the numbers game” and toward measuring the impact of the Division’s work – such as the number of hazards identified and corrected on site, the number and percentage of workers affected by positive changes; the number and scope of new H&S measures implemented as a result of the inspection; the number of employers (and the number of their employees) assisted, etc.;
 - Whatever performance criteria selected by Headquarters, it should be applied consistently and uniformly throughout the Division;

Long range planning

- The Division is facing a near-term wave of retirements and critical skills and experience will be lost; a sustained program of training and mentoring is needed to maintain DOSH expertise in areas like tower cranes, electrical hazards, and industrial hygiene;
- Need to find a way to do long range planning in addition to reacting to immediate crises and “emergency triage” situations;
- Need to have a workable plan to deal with the annual California state budget crisis in May-August period in order to stockpile materials and keep field work going;
- Need to plan for the inevitable crisis likes infectious disease outbreaks (H1N1, whooping cough, etc.), natural disasters, and climate change (more heat);

Case review policies

- Major cases sent up the chain for mandatory or discretionary review frequently languish for weeks and months at the regional or headquarters level, often up to within days of the statutory six-month “drop dead” date for issuance;
- Headquarters needs to establish clear policies as to what cases require review by region and/or HQ; HQ (Legal, Medical, Region) need to work with District Offices on these cases as early as possible during the inspection so key aspects are reviewed and suggestions made as the work is being done, rather than in a scramble at the end;
- Headquarters needs to set appropriate deadlines for its own review, and that at the regional level, of cases sent up the chain, and then ensure the reviews are conducted in a timely manner;
- Headquarters and regional offices should adopt a collaborative, professional tone with CSHOs and DMs during the review process; constructive criticism is valued, but disrespectful and fault-finding attitudes undermine the Division’s morale and effectiveness;

Reporting issues

- District office staff are repeatedly asked for the same information in different formats (daily report, week-ahead and month-ahead reports); often different managers ask for the same information, apparently without sharing it among themselves;
- HQ should streamline the reporting process, reduce the number of items reported to the minimum necessary and ensure that managers share the requested information rather than individually request the same information;

Uniformity within DOSH

- Need to have all units of the Division operate the same based on uniform compliance with an updated P&P (below);
- Need to train/update all field personnel (Compliance and Consultation) on new regulations and DOSH policies before they take effect – this could be done with memos from the R&S units; regular, short Division-wide webinars; short workshops before or after regular staff meetings;
- Need to have consistent and uniform policies in issuing permits so contractors do not play District Offices off against one another; additional training and written procedures and checklists may be needed;
- Need to circulate draft Consultation Service publications to enforcement personnel prior to publication so all parts of the Division are on the same page on compliance information provided to employers;

Outreach issues

- Need a plan for better distribution of Consultation Service publications to employers and the general public; work more closely with trade associations, local chambers of commerce, unions and community groups;
- Need a plan to reach small and medium size enterprises, especially in high hazard industries;
- Use the more economical and efficient “print on demand” mode for hard copying printing, especially for critical and popular publications like the pocket construction guide;

Policy & Procedures Manuals

- Many P&Ps are out-of-date, incomplete, incorrect and contradictory;
- HQ needs to revise and reorganize the Division’s P&P – both the Administrative and Compliance P&Ps – and ensure these are followed consistently and uniformly throughout the Division;
- Among the P&Ps described as needing revision or development are the documents related to: OPU hearings (not consistent with Title 8 sections 340.40 to 340.51); AB 2774; complaints (better triage needed); penalty structure and correction notice; discovery and public records request; privacy considerations;

Internal IIPP – H&S program – Employees rights

- DOSH needs to establish an effective IIPP – same as every other employer in the state;

- DOSH needs to establish effective internal health and safety programs, including respiratory protection, medical surveillance for toxic exposures during site inspections; regular ergonomic inspections for administrative staff and others with ergo exposures;
- Region V (Mining & Tunneling) needs its own senior industrial hygienist to address serious health hazards experience by M&T inspectors in the field;
- HQ should conduct a training for all personnel on their rights as employees, including basic personnel policies and processes, disciplinary procedures, union grievance procedures, etc.;

Telecommuting Issues

- DOSH should allow staff to telecommute to maximize efficiency and effectiveness of field staff by allowing strategic placement of CSHOs and consultants throughout the state;

Hiring issues

- Need to hire industrial hygienists if the DOSH health program is to be revived; this would involve rewriting the “safety engineer” job description so as to be able to hire industrial hygienists – such a proposal was given to HQ in 2007 but never acted upon; consider re-establishing the junior IH program; need to re-interpret current “safety engineer” job description so previously classified industrial hygienists can be assigned health inspections as part of their regular work;
- Increase the multi-language capacity of the Division through deliberate policy to recruit and hire Spanish-speakers;
- Increase expertise in the Division by recruiting and hiring experienced construction workers as safety engineers;
- Need to address the issue of pay disparities between the District Manager, Regional Manager and Senior Safety Engineer positions which have created obstacles to promoting and retaining DMs;
- Given the relatively higher salaries of safety engineers, the Division should be able to hire more people with technical degrees and high levels of training and experience;
- Need to hire people with good technical skills – we can train them to be good inspectors or consultants, but cannot compensate for lack of technical skills;

Establish a “DOSH Academy”

- New hires and newly promoted supervisors and managers should be part of a mandatory and timely set of trainings and ongoing mentoring;
- Newly hired and new promoted personnel should receive all required training for these positions soon after their hire or promotion (not months or even years later);
- New field personnel should go out with more experienced personnel for a significant period of time; experienced field staff should perform regular “ride-alongs” with new hires; long-term mentors should be assigned to new hires and newly promoted personnel; new field staff should be provided with aids like inspection and office task checklists during the mentoring period;

- Managers should get “real manager training” on communications skills, personnel relations, time management, and efficient work organization;

Website and Intranet resources

- Enhance the DOSH intranet to include pre-formatted text of regulations, standardized AVDs, access to shared resources, interpretation of new regulations and policies, access to significant DARs and related changes;
- Develop a list or data base, to be posted on the DOSH intranet, of people within the Division who have specialized skills and experience so that other DOSH staff will know who to contact for technical assistance;
- Develop a list of “Who’s Who” for headquarters units (including personnel, accounting, program staff) with areas of job responsibilities so field staff know who to contact [Dr. Howard generated such a roster, with photographs, following the EGIP process in 1999.]
- Need to develop a concise enforcement inspection guide – like the pocket construction guide – to provide CSHOs with checklists of hazards and regulations, flow charts of inspection procedures and requirements, etc.;
- Need to develop and post on the intranet checklists like a “cheat sheet” for safety engineers of key health/industrial hygiene issues and regulations; and a “cheat sheet” for industrial hygienists of key safety issues and regulations;
- DOSH should adopt the practice of the DIR website which features a “check new laws” button its website to alert the public and DIR employees of new regulations;

Paperwork issues

- Need to find a way to spend more time “doing” inspections rather than “documenting” inspections;
- Need to generate electronic versions of all forms, creating as many “fill in” formats as possible; have a IMIS/OIS data base where information is entered only once and then can be accessed/copied/dragged from the original form;
- Need to eliminate as many forms as possible, especially forms that overlap or request identical information as other forms;

Medical Unit issues

- Need additional staff for the Medical Unit staff, including occupational physician, occupational nurse, toxicologist and ergonomist;
- Need to establish a protocol for using and storing confidential medical records in the District Offices;
- Need to enhance cooperation with CDPH and the UC campuses to develop long term resources for the Division to assist in standards development, compliance inspections, legal defenses, and other issues; need to have enough Medical Unit staff for an assigned DOSH liaison to UCSF to establish a regular rotation by resident physicians through DOSH offices;
- Need to develop a policy between the Legal and Medical units to enhance the medical unit’s contributions;

- Need to review Form 90M process to request Medical Unit assistance to ensure proper documentation, early involvement of the Medical Unit in appropriate cases, early review of medical records and early coordination with the Legal Unit and District Offices for citation issuance and legal defense;

Asbestos Unit issues

- Need to raise fees for certification and other services;
- Asbestos Unit's data base software is completely obsolete and is in danger of permanently crashing, which would eliminate essential records going back to 1992;
- Asbestos unit needs to have an on-line data base that could be checked by other DOSH units and the public for real-time information on contractors' certification and workers' training status [one existed previously but it was hacked once and never established again];
- Staffing levels of the asbestos-related units are insufficient to conduct its own inspections; District Offices doing few, if any, project permit inspections, or responding to Asbestos unit or local AQMD referrals related to contractor certification and worker training issues; Asbestos units are not receiving copies of the project notifications sent to District Offices;
- Asbestos units are under-utilized by other DOSH units – the unit has information on contractors and their histories that could be used for compliance inspections;

Research & Standards Unit issues

- Research & Standards units are under-utilized by both compliance and consultation offices; R&S staff could assist seniors, consultants and CSHOs with research and analysis;

APPENDIX 1

Issues Affecting the Division As a Whole

Compliance inspection issues

- Staffing levels are simply insufficient to perform all legally-required work –such as follow-up inspections, 10th letter inspections, permit inspection – and insufficient to meet legal and Fed OSHA mandates for opening and closing inspections;
- DOSH should develop ongoing and mutual assistance relationships with other regulatory agencies, such as DLSE, CSLB, EDD, Department of Insurance, CDPH OHB, Lead, and Radiological Health branches, HESIS, DPR, and Cal/EPA and US EPA;
- Increase the multi-language capacity of the Division through deliberate policy to recruit and hire Spanish-speakers, use of paid/unpaid internships for bilingual college students (especially from Central Valley schools); provide support to DOSH staff (both field and office) to study Spanish at local colleges;
- DOSH should make better use of the mass media to inform employers and the public about the requirements of the law; to publicize cases, hazards and the consequences of unsafe workplaces; to raise the Division’s visibility and enhance public support for the mission and mandate;
- Reestablish a functioning DOSH Emergency Response Team and/or allow DOSH offices to develop ongoing relationships with local ERTs;
- Heat illness prevention: after all these summers, Division should establish a regular heat illness prevention program that does not overwhelm other issues, plan for it and execute the plan; need better targeting; should use rental cars rather than personal or state cars;
- Agricultural safety issues: need to address ag safety issue beyond heat, sanitation and hand labor, such as tractors, ladders, electrocutions, harvesting machines, and ag subgroups like dairy, nut processors, wine producers; and in neglected areas (Central Coast, Imperial Valley);
- Reestablish the carcinogen control unit, which effectively no longer exists;
- District Offices should have enough staff to be able to field “imminent hazard” or “disaster response” teams;
- If DOSH is going to do programmed inspections, and have units dedicated to programmed inspections, then field inspectors should be given enough time to do comprehensive, effective inspections that will capture the universe of hazards on site;
- Need more coordination and better information for targeted inspections in HHU and EEEEC;
- Employer should not receive abatement credit in penalties until after abatement has been verified; this will require sufficient staffing to perform this verification;

- If DOSH is going to take on “novel issues” like bloodborne pathogen exposures in the adult film industry, then it should either devote the resources necessary to do the work properly – or not do it at all;
- District Offices should be given the authority – as existed previously – to establish “Local Emphasis Programs” targeting key local employers such as, for example in the Sacramento area: strawberry nurseries, sheep herders, loggers, cattle ranch hands, dairies, lead paint removal on area bridges;
- Assign attorneys to present for all depositions of CSHOs;
- Resolve personnel issues, including sexual harassment cases, in a timely manner;
- Assign two CSHOs for fatality and “high profile” cases so they are done correctly and the extra work can be shared;
- Issue standardized Cal/OSHA logo clothing to be worn in the field; develop a “more professional looking” identification card and/or badge;

Consultation Service issues

- Many consultation service staff feel as if Consultation is the “poor cousin” or “second-class citizen” in comparison to compliance; this status seen in availability of training, quality and availability of inspection equipment; lack of collaboration when DOSH policies are established; low visibility for Consultation in DOSH publicity activities;
- Key vacancies remain unfilled at Regional Manager and Area Manager levels;
- Key vacancy of a graphic designer in Research & Education;
- Not enough multi-lingual capacity (Hmong, Punjabi, Spanish-Mixteco-Zapotec-Triki, other languages);
- Need to evaluate and revise the current 20-day deadline for reports after visits; such short deadlines are not enough to conduct thorough inspections, on-site industrial hygiene monitoring, necessary research, and provide in-depth assistance to employers;
- Need better coordination and information flows between Consultation and Compliance units – allow consultants to go out with CSHOs so the consultants better understand compliance procedures; allow consultants to attend compliance staff meetings (done in Sacramento) so consultants better understand compliance procedures; allow consultants to attend compliance appeal hearings and standards board meetings; better coordination between consultation and compliance on employer variance requests; provide CSHOs and consultation staff with information about the activities and procedures of the “other side of the house” so that all DOSH employees understand the workings of DOSH units;
- Need to get more stakeholder input in deciding services to offer and priorities among projects;
- Need better coordination between the high hazard units of consultation and compliance to share information, challenges, successful experiences;
- Field personnel and telephone hotline personnel need intensive training on Title 8 regs and compliance unit practices so as to be able to provide employers and public with accurate and complete information; especially when new or revised regulations are issued;

- Consultants need more training than currently provided, especially for those with the CSP certification who need classes to maintain their certification, allow and support CSPs to take outside courses for certification maintenance purposes;
- Need more technical assistance and mentoring by seniors for field personnel;
- Need annual contract with “Comp-line” service for workers comp data, but procurement procedures are always difficult because it is a sole-source contract;
- Need access to internet sites for research and consultation purposed – many sites currently blocked;
- Need state cars for consultants doing field work;
- Streamline reporting procedures and develop standardized electronic forms and letters so that consultants spend more time in the field and less time in front of a computer;
- Allow consultants to do more compliance assistance with employers before reports are written, so reduce the amount of report-writing time and enhance immediate correction of hazards;
- Conduct more training with high hazard employers;
- Work more closely with trade associations on outreach and training, especially in high hazard industries;
- Need additional and ongoing resources for Central Valley offices which are swamped every year with heat-related outreach and educational activities;
- Need to make more and better use of non-English media – print, electronic and community-levels billboards/posters;
- Should increase the number of internships available for bilingual college students, such as from Central Valley universities, to increase DOSH’s language capacity;
- Publication-related issues:
 - o Need HQ to provide ongoing guidance on what publications to produce, currently have 35-40 subjects under consideration and many more are possible;
 - o Need to get systematic input from stakeholders on priorities for materials;
 - o Many publications now out of print;
 - o Some publications out of date;
 - o Develop model “model programs” for new regulations;
 - o Develop more targeted materials for high hazard employers;
 - o Develop more simplified and schematic publications for small and mid-size employers;
 - o Keep popular publications, such as the “pocket guide for the construction industry,” in print and available in hard copy;
 - o Use “print on demand” to save on printing costs;
 - o Need resources to purchase photos, images and graphics;
 - o Need expert assistance to make materials effective for low literacy audiences;
 - o Need better marketing and distribution of published materials, internally as well as outside DOSH;
 - o Need to regularly evaluate the impact and effectiveness of Consultation materials’ content, format, accuracy and usefulness;
- Need more professional looking business cards;

Administrative staff issues

- Administrative staff have no career or promotion path at present, only the OA and OT positions exist; all admin positions should be re-evaluated to determine actual duties and appropriate job classifications (MST, AGPA, SSA, SSM) that would provide upward mobility. Create deeper classes that would allow for promotions within the class;
- Administrative staff receive virtually no training from the Division. Ongoing training would enhance skills essential for efficient offices and also provide a path for promotions. Training topics should include computer programs and skills, ARO duties, personnel policies and employee benefits, office management skills;
- Allow admin staff to become safety technicians as one potential career pathway;
- Understaffing of admin personnel in DOSH offices means over-work for the admin staff present and require seniors and field staff to spend excessive amounts of time doing clerical work;
- Inadequate training of new employees means that admin staff do considerable, unrecognized training of new hires;
- Re-establish the practice of statewide meetings of admin personnel (last one held in 2005) to conduct a day-long update of policies and procedures, presentations on DOSH's mission and the functions of its various units, and presentations on efficient office management techniques;
- Re-establish the HQ Program Office and assign IMIS coordinators to be supervised by this unit;
- The Division should hire one paralegal for every compliance office to provide assistance in handling appeal-related document and FOIA requests, preparing CSHOs and exhibits for hearings, and conducting hearings;
- Update the Administrative Policies & Procedures manual and standardize work procedures across the Division;
- Include admin staff in DOSH webinars on policies and procedures that affect them;
- Provide admin staff with training on legal and medical confidentiality laws and procedures;
- Provide intensive training on the new OIS system before it is implemented. The Division should designate a single, central person to oversee the transition to OIS;
- Provide admin staff with ergonomics work station evaluations and training;
- Provide admin staff with training about the mission and mandate of DOSH, a "virtual tour" of the agency so staff can understand its various parts;
- Provide professional quality scanners that could copy case files and generate page numbers electronically so as to avoid repeated manual photocopying and Bates-stamping of case files;
- Establish a intranet share file folder that contains all DOSH forms, preferably in electronic, fill-in format;
- Develop a better system for handling case files (such as standardized sign-out and filing systems) to prevent loss of files, complaints, accident reports;
- Develop a better system for storing old cases files – both physically and in terms of retrieval;

- Do not buy expensive equipment if the Division cannot maintain it;
- Plan for the annual budget crisis by stockpiling essential supplies (paper, toner) well before the end of the fiscal year;

Training issues

- Establish a defined, stable budget for the Training Unit;
- Obtain better training facilities in southern California;
- Re-establish use of “Individual Development Plans” (IDP) as one tool in planning future training topics and priorities;
- Decide whether field staff should obtain and maintain professional certifications (CIH, CSP) and work certifications for asbestos, lead, Hazwopper, etc.; if so, then professional staff will need support for training required to maintain professional certifications;
- Provide training to populations within DOSH that have received little or none, including consultants, administrative staff, attorneys and legal secretaries, regional and headquarters seniors;
- Provide information to all DOSH staff about internal training courses and opportunities for training from outside organizations;
- Recognize that an important aspect of DOSH trainings is the opportunity to meet and get to know other DOSH employees;
- Trainings should be practical and have tangible results related to what participants actually do: ability to recognize hazards, enforce regulations, advise employers, read blueprints and schematics, calibrate equipment, write citations and reports, etc.;
- Training curriculum should include both expert information and practical applications for enforcement and consultation – instruction team should include subject matter experts (could be outsiders) and experienced DOSH staff able to explain and demonstrate application to Title 8;
- Training methodology should include more “hands on” activities with equipment, more “field days” to visit working sites (perhaps VPP plants), more participatory, interactive classroom activities (small group activities, brainstorm, role playing, group problem-solving exercises, best-practices session);
- Hold separate sessions (for selected subjects) for newly-hired staff and for veteran, experienced staff, perhaps “refresher” courses for longtime employees and full-blown course for recently hired;
- Allow seniors to conduct “mini-trainings” of one to three hours in district or regional offices on subjects about which they have experience and expertise;
- Use webinars for short (45-60 minutes) presentations of easily-defined and contained subjects such as new regulations, new policies, or specific hazards;
- Use retired annuitants or recently retired staff as instructors to take advantage of their experience and expertise;
- Establish an on-going “DOSH Academy” for new hires with a series of courses and mentoring, “new hire” training should occur no later than six months after hire; for staff promoted to managers with a series of courses and mentoring;
- Provide training for staff selected to be instructors from UC’s LOHP and LOSH;

- Conduct shorter sessions – five days is too long for effective training – some interviewed staff suggested a 3-days limit;
- Establish better oversight and facilitation of trainings – ensure that instructors do not have overlaps and repetition in their presentations, do not go off on tangents for extended periods of time; answer the questions they are asked;
- Establish better oversight of participants – insist participants are punctual, stay focused and do not disrupt classes;
- Develop ongoing, systematic post-training activities, including sending participants that “recap” the main points of the course, sending out materials developed during the course of the training, “cheat sheets” to take on inspections of checklists, regs or information from the course; these items could be sent on CDs or flash-drives;
- Allow DOSH staff to take courses at appropriate outside institutions, such as fire department Hazmat or ERT classes, union-sponsored equipment classes, OTI classes, PSM classes;
- Make better use of the educational materials on DOSH’s intranet (“Jack’s Stuff” pages), and make better use of educational materials available on the internet generally;
- Re-establish the “junior” program for admin staff and others without prior training into the professional classifications;
- Provide training – or facilitate training by, perhaps as an exchange, other agencies – on the regulations enforced by DLSE, Cal EPA and AQMDs, county and city public health departments, county environmental/hazmat departments, city building departments, and other federal, state, county and city agencies;
- Interviewed staff were almost evenly divided as to whether OTI courses and Fed OSHA instructors are useful or not appropriate (not Title 8 focused);
- Interviewed staff were almost evenly divided as to whether webinars are useful or a waste of time;

CALICO issues

- Near unanimous opinion of interviewed field staff and managers that CALICO should either be abolished or undergo a major reorganization to achieve its stated purpose. Interviewed staff reported that delays, lack of cooperation, and arbitrary decisions have meant it has been difficult (sometimes impossible) to obtain calibrated equipment, sampling media, and approval (from the non-industrial hygiene manager) for laboratory analytical services. Interviewed staff believe that “problems at CALICO” represented the single largest obstacle to conducting health-related monitoring by DOSH field personnel;
- In the future, inspection and office equipment should not be bought without consulting the people who will use it (past problems include too-large cameras and non-functional thermometers);
- In the future, equipment sent to field offices should be in calibration and functional;
- In the future, CALICO should provide technical assistance to field inspectors using unfamiliar equipment;

- In the future, CALICO should have on-site industrial hygiene expertise;
- Interviewed staff had divided opinions on whether the Division should have its own industrial hygiene equipment, or simply rent state-of-the-art equipment (calibrated and functional) from vendors

Resource issues

Technical resources

- Renew the Barclay's Title 8 subscription for DOSH offices [renewed following the Listening Tour];
- Provide full access to the internet for research purposes;
- Provide access to hard-copy and on-line technical information, including current and T8-referred ANSI standards, current and T8-referred building, electrical and HVAC codes and standards, key reference websites;
- Provide updated field office libraries with key reference texts, including hard copies of Consultation publications like the Construction Pocket Guide, etc.;
- Provide access to Lexus Nexus in District Offices;
- Purchase Rutter Group Civil Appeals and Writs and Civil Procedure Before Trial forms;
- Enhance the DOSH intranet with a "data bank" of materials including model AVDs for specific hazards and citations; inspection checklists and protocols; "best practices" in inspections for CSHOs/consultants, "best practices" in office management and in administrative work; hyper-links to key research and reference sites, equipment manuals, list of internal DOSH subject matter experts;
- Create a searchable data base for Appeals Board decisions (ALJ and DAR);
- Create a searchable data base of Fed OSHA and DOSH letters of interpretation;
- Create a searchable data base of DOSH staff with special skills, training and experience so other staff can identify and consult with them;

Electronic resources

- "Get DOSH into the 21st century" in terms of computers, data bases, electronic devices – provide current versions of computers, standard software, cell phones, GPS units, electronic equipment capable of talking to one another;
- Develop a five-year technology plan for procurement and replacement of electronic equipment, devices and software;
- Provide full access to the internet for research purposes, lift the blocking of sites necessary for conducting research;
- Provide software for redacting confidential information from documents;
- Enhance the DOSH intranet with a "data bank" of materials including model AVDs for specific hazards and citations; inspection checklists and protocols; "best practices" in inspections for CSHOs/consultants, "best practices" in office management and in administrative work; hyper-links to key research and reference sites, equipment manuals, list of internal DOSH subject matter experts;
- Create a searchable data base for Appeals Board decisions (ALJ and DAR);
- Create a searchable data base of Fed OSHA and DOSH letters of interpretation;

- Create a searchable data base of DOSH staff with special skills, training and experience so other staff can identify and consult with them;
- Provide access to Lexus Nexus in District Offices;
- Provide all DOSH offices with standard software (some offices cannot make PDF files);
- Asbestos Unit's statewide data base (Filemaker 4.0) is completely obsolete and must be replaced ASAP to avoid losing records going back to 1992;
- Asbestos Unit needs a on-line data base to provide real-time information for those checking workers' training records and contractors' certifications;
- Research & Standards needs a data mining software for research purposes;
- Medical Unit needs access to on-line data bases for research purposes;
- Legal Unit needs standard legal software to do the following: joint calendars, deadline calendars, data mining and search engines, case management, data bank of motions and briefs, as well as scanners for depositions, voice recognition software for typing;
- PD&TU unit needs a data base to manage and maintain DOSH employee training records [received after the Listening Tour];
- Replace cell phones with iPhones and iPads that have internet access in the field;
- Provide satellite phones for district offices with areas that do not have 100% cell phone service;
- Create electronic versions of all forms that can be filled-in and downloaded;
- Create an electronic "suggestion box" for HQ so staff can send items directly;
- Create an internal DOSH "chat room" for informal exchange of experiences and knowledge (would likely require a moderator);

Inspection equipment

- Issue more professional looking DOSH identification badges;
- Provide field staff with state cars;
- Do not assign hybrid gasoline-natural gas cars as they have little trunk space and present a safety hazard in collisions ("rolling bombs")
- Provide "smart phones" or "tablets" with internet access to field inspectors for on-site technical resources during inspections;
- Provide GPS units to all field inspectors (some staff wanted compasses as well);
- Provide pocket-size cameras (not large, bulky ones) and appropriate video cameras;
- Provide field personnel with fall protection equipment;
- Provide functional thermometers;
- Provide each field office with basic set of industrial hygiene and safety measuring and inspection equipment (including noise, dust, airborne chemicals, ventilation flow, thermometers, soil tester, calipers, wheel measuring tape, grade setter laser, Cal/OSHA barricade tape;
- Ensure field staff have all necessary equipment and do not have to provide their own personal items (car, computer, cameras, cell phones, etc.) ;

Office equipment

- Do not buy office equipment without consulting office managers and administrative staff for their specifications and opinions of what is required;
- Replace obsolete or non-functional equipment;
- Do not buy “three in one” (phone, fax, scanner) units – create bottlenecks during heavy use and often one malfunction takes out all three functions;
- Obtain professional quality scanners for offices so that case files can be scanned just once and generate an electronic version of the file;
- Obtain a professional quality numerator that will automatically generate page numbers while copying or scanning;
- Provide offices with “ergonomic risk reducing” equipment – electrical staplers, electric hole punch, electric page number generator, etc.;
- Provide offices with color printers, but either raise the limit of Cal cards to purchase expensive color ink cartridges or find less expensive color printers;
- Provide professional quality stationary for HQ and Legal Unit;
- Provide phones for field offices that have a “caller ID” function so that the telephone numbers of non-English speakers can be determined for a call back;
- Provide telephones that have an intercom function;
- District office DIMS units should be scrapped;
- Asbestos Unit needs an industrial-quality card-making machine to produce more professional and more durable certification cards for contractors;

Facility issues

- Install security barriers in field offices that do not have anything to protect DOSH employees from threatening members of the public (Fresno and Sacramento District Offices, Fresno Consultation Area Office);
- Provide confidential storage space for medical files in DOSH offices; provide adequate storage space for rule-making files in R&S offices;
- Provide adequate training room in southern California (existing spaces too small);
- Provide adequate space for staff and their work stations (Consultation Research & Education office, HHU-South, Los Angeles District Office, Monrovia District Office, Oakland VPP office, Region I, Sacramento District Office, Van Nuys);
- Provide adequate space for a conference room (Oakland Legal Unit);

APPENDIX 2

Issues Specific to DOSH Offices and Work Units

Headquarters (Chief's office, Medical Unit, Training Unit)

- Need dedicated admin staff: should be one for Chief, one for each DC, one for office as a whole;
- Need supervisor for entire 19th floor, including HQ administration;
- No color printer in HQ [installed after the Listening Tour];
- Budget/personnel: key vacancies; three people doing five people's jobs;
- Medical Unit: need to overcome isolation from other med personnel in exchanging information and consultations; need to develop a "team" to work on medical issues;
- Medical Unit: need access to on-line resources, data bases;
- Medical Unit: need to overcome an imbalance in the work where there is not enough time to go out with inspectors; too much time in preparing for legal cases that settle; also Medical Unit not utilized well by DOSH field units;
- Medical Unit: need administrative support (none exists);
- Medical Unit: need a fax and printer for receipt of confidential medical information;
- Medical Unit: need permission to take courses/attend conferences required to maintain medical certifications;
- Medical Unit: need to make arrangements to take advantage of UCSF residents and other medical resources;
- PD&TU: need a training facility in southern California, lost old training room in real estate shuffle (West Covina) and current one (Santa Ana) is very small;
- PD&TU: Need data base to manage EE training records [obtained after the Listening Tour];
- PD&TU: need more cooperation from local DOSH units in forwarding "pink" and "green" forms as well as training records to PDTU;
- PD&TU: Local DOSH units need to have local/freebie courses reviewed and approved by PDTU;
- PD&TU: Need better communication within PDTU and training committee, especially for changes in dates and topics;

Legal Unit – Bureau of Investigation

- Legal Unit: key vacancies with attorneys and legal secretaries, including attorney(s) located in Fresno and/or Bakersfield; administrative person to perform ARO duties;
- Legal unit needs its own conference room/meeting space;
- Legal unit does not have the standard computer software needed to run an effective legal unit – calendar, deadlines, data mining and search engines, case management, motions, joint calendars; scanners for depositions, voice recognition software;

- Need IT support to clean out junk in new computers;
- Need transcripts of hearings;
- Need expert witnesses, especially medical and toxicologists;
- the Division should consider hiring paralegals for many tasks now done by attorneys – discovery, subpoenas, settlement documents;
- Witness fees are too low; some witnesses are not permitted to take or paid for overtime (travel, multi-day hearings);
- Need to get/circulate Appeals Board minutes;
- Chief's conference room is not sound-proof with attorney's office next door;
- Attorneys need specific training on computer basics and new legal software;
- Legal Unit should consider assigning one attorney to given group of DOs, work with DMs and staff on a regular basis; and/or dividing attorneys into specialty areas (particular regs/hazards, writs, hearings, legal analysis);
- Attorneys should go to new CSHO classes to understand job; understand policies that affect issuance of citations;
- Legal Unit should form teams of attorneys to work on major projects;
- Legal Unit should prohibit last minute referrals to Legal within a week (2-3 weeks) of hearing;
- Attorneys need administrative time off to take continuing education credit courses;
- Legal Unit should provide more input from supervisor or collective input from other attorneys related to hearing strategies, settlements, etc – perhaps regular staff meetings to review cases and issues;
- Legal Unit should establish a “brief bank” to stop reinventing the wheel with standard briefs, common citations and legal issues;
- Legal Unit should gather regularly to plan long-term, strategize about developments on horizon, get everyone on the same page with particular issues or practices;
- Legal Unit should establish a standard schedule of interaction between attorneys and District Offices after case assignment, e.g. at 30 days; at 90 days;
- Legal Unit: attorneys would like to be able to provide more services within DOSH besides litigation, such as deposition support in civil cases, prospective/affirmative cases to protect workers, amicus briefs where appropriate;
- Legal Unit: secretaries need a typewriter for envelopes, subpoenas, etc.;
- Legal Unit needs proper stationery; stamped-on letterhead indicates to outside world a lack of professionalism;
- Need a manager on site in Los Angeles office;
- Need statewide legal staff meetings;
- Need more interaction between North and South legal units;
- Los Angeles Legal Unit has no color printer;
- Need a fully-staffed medical unit to provide better medical expertise during inspections and at hearings;
- Purchase the Rutter Group Civil Appeals and Writs – Forms;
- Purchase the Rutter Group Civil Procedure before Trial – Forms;
- Need clearer policies with respect to privacy matters and treatment of BOI materials;

- Need a telecommuting policy;
- Legal Unit needs state cars and parking spaces in Los Angeles state building
- Need an Assistant Chief Counsel for case assignment;
- BOI: too small, down to four investigators; hard to find qualified peace officers;
- BOI: only have Lexus-Nexus as research tool, inadequate for needs;
- BOI: shared administrative staff not adequate for work load;
- BOI: unit has antique computer equipment; need more and better equipment, such as digital recorders and camera, because BOI has a higher burden of proof.
- BOI: staff members have received no training at all; would like to get standard peace officer training and related “POST” training; CDAA meetings are not training; need criminal investigative training for outside vendor;
- BOI needs to be notified immediately on all fatalities; BOI needs to be notified early on all serious injuries and willful; need to rewrite P&P for BOI to state that the 36s for fatalities should be faxed to BOI immediately followed up with a phone call.

Research & Standards Unit

- No clear chain of command with so many different office locations and managers;
- Need to appoint a permanent Principal Safety Engineer;
- Need an epidemiologist and ergonomist for R&S unit, or the Medical Unit;
- DOSH carcinogen use control unit no longer exists;
- R&S/Health: with the 2007 transfer of most industrial hygienists to safety engineers, there has been a virtual collapse of DOSH health enforcement;
- R&S/Oakland: no administrative staff, for years; no second senior safety engineer;
- R&S/Oakland: no storage space available for rule-making files (both in use and history);
- No electronic data base/search/mining capability;
- R&S staff divided on whether unit spends too much time spent assisting units and not enough on regulation development – other staff members hold the opposite view;

Research & Standards – Crane Unit

- Need permanent Principal Engineer;
- Crane Unit had one Senior, two CSHOs, and two clerical; down to one person
- Incompetent crane certifiers are not having their licenses rescinded due to lack of support from legal unit and HQ;
- Fear catastrophic crane accident;
- Travel restrictions prevent crane audits in San Diego and Redding;

Asbestos Units

- Asbestos unit staff feel they are “invisible” to the rest of DOSH;
- Staff vacancies mean no field investigations – unit had 12 staff in December 2005, in June 2011 have 7 staff plus part-time student – not enough staff to audit asbestos training companies – only one industrial hygienist left in unit;

- No occupational carcinogen registration unit staff in south; only one person in north (two recent retired staff); no inspections being done;
- Outdated equipment (took five years to get a new printer);
- Spend huge amount of time on data entry with outdated equipment and software;
- Data base system (Filemaker 4.0) completely obsolete – will be inaccessible very soon and data back to 1992 will be lost;
- Need to raise fees for asbestos registration, certification and other services, they have not been raised in many years;
- Asbestos Unit should – but does not – receive electronic copy of notifications going to District Offices so that history and related info can be shared;
- Asbestos Unit staff not allowed to cite employers – should have authority or ability to accompany CSHOs on asbestos inspections ;
- Need P&P style manual for how to do work in asbestos units;
- Need better card making machine (more professional-looking, more durable) for issuing asbestos unit-related cards to contractors and others;
- Coordination within the Unit is difficult with one part of asbestos unit in Oakland, another in Sacramento, and none in southern California;

DOSH Technology – CFOI – CALICO

- Need a single office manager for 19th floor in Oakland to handle administration/technology/space issues for DOSH offices in Oakland State Office Building;
- Calico: need industrial hygiene capacity and Senior level person;
- Calico: instrument techs want hands-on experience with equipment to better understand operating principles and uses by CSHOs; do ride-alongs with CSHOs;
- Calico: need to have a list of competent technical people (both compliance and consultation) to whom referrals for training/assistance can be made;
- Need ability to search online for vendors – computer access is restricted;
- Inspectors are not using DIMs for photographs;
- People need to take better care of state equipment;
- Lack of staff keeps equipment from being calibrated;
- DOSH Technology staff needs IH training;
- DOSH Technology is understaffed as it is currently responsible for: Calico, facilities, contracts, telecommunications, web postings, equipment purchase, digital camera, video conferences, TCIF and CFOI;

Region I office

- No Region I office exists [office established after Listening Tour];
- No administrative staff assigned for Region 1;

Region II Office

- need safe location to store state vehicles;
- need a barrier to public entry into the offices;
- staff do not want to relocate to downtown Sacramento (parking costs, transit time);

Region III Office

- Regional office understaffed – short one Senior Safety Engineer and one admin staff;
- Region as a whole is understaffed in both CSHO and admin positions;

Region IV Office (also including Medical Unit staff)

- Limited space in office; Region 4 staff and Medical Unit staff are crowded into Van Nuys District Office; Bakersfield and Ventura staff have also been added to this space;

Region V (M&T) Office

- Critical vacancies: seven CSHO positions in unit;
- Difficult to coordinate large geographic area – Sacramento, San Bernardino, Van Nuys with HQ in Chico – especially with current budget restrictions.
- Unit has experienced a high rate of admin staff turn-over;
- Staff feel that training remotely via webinars or conference calls does not work;

Region VI Office

- Understaffing has led overwork and injuries – worker comp claims have been filed by four Region VI clerical staff.; staff expected to perform at a level that current staffing can't maintain;
- Need official telecommuting policy;

District Offices in Regions I, II, III and IV

Concord District Office

- no industrial hygienist in office;
- more than 80,000 ERs in a district with only four CSHOs

Foster City District Office

- No site-specific issues raised, although issues capture in the Division-wide summary above were brought up by staff;

Fremont/San Jose District Office

- Two CSHO vacancies in Fremont;
- Not enough Spanish speakers in the office;
- Geographic scope of district too large – cannot cover with number of CSHOs assigned; DOSH policy will not allow CSHOs to stay overnight even when hours away from homes;
- Prohibition of OT pay has meant some CSHOs “timed out” and were not able to respond to accidents;
- DOSH policy prohibiting telecommuting – despite the fact that some CSHOs live far away – means staff are required to come to office rather than work remotely;
- District Office is short-handed in south part of District, need satellite offices in various parts of District;

- Salinas field office in DLSE office is being eliminated to make a DLSE conference room; CSHO now has nowhere to go;
- Need computer IT assistance in Salinas – not available – cannot see webinars;

Fresno District Office

- No security barrier in office and office has experienced incidents with angry employers and citizens; and very old furniture (pre-cubicle) in office;
- One unfilled administrative position for more than one year;
- Lack of multi-lingual capacity in office;
- Only three state cars for nine CSHOs in a very large geographical district; CSHOs required to use personal cars;
- Computers down all together from August to November 2010;
- High volume of accident investigations and office has an insufficient number of CSHOs;

Los Angeles District Office

- CSHOs would like to telecommute as the commute into downtown LA is difficult;
- Need better access to interpreters;
- SEP inspections are very time consuming and hurt individual performance numbers;

Modesto District Office

- Only one administrative staff for the office and CSHOs spend considerable time on clerical work [a second admin person was added after the Listening Tour];
- Cell phones do not work in all areas of the district – could use satellite phones;
- Only three state vehicles available for eight CSHOs;
- In some inspections, state vehicles not appropriate for ag field enforcement (can't handle mud and uneven terrain), requiring CSHOs to use own vehicle for inspections and then having to wait for extended periods for reimbursement via TEC;

Monrovia District Office

- CSHOs would like to telecommute;

Oakland District Office

- Need third administrative staff for large office (10 CSHOs);
- Need Spanish-speaker for complaints and inspections;
- Supervision is difficult because size of office (10 CSHOs and two admin) is beyond accepted “span of control” of 5-7 employees;
- Need copier contract that spans over California fiscal years because the contracts for the last several years have expired at end of fiscal year and the copier always seems to break down just when there is no service contract in force;

Redding Field Office

- CSHOs have to do a “duty day” in Sacramento District Office, which involves a lot of traveling;

Sacramento District Office

- No security barrier in office and office has experienced incidents with angry employers and citizens;
- Only have three administrative staff for large office (15 CSHOs), used to have four administrative staff;
- There are no state vehicles assigned to the District Office so CSHOs must use their own vehicles;
- IMIS connection was out for several months in 2010;
- District Office now has an “all-in-one” copier/fax/scanner that was bought without consultation with staff; the problem is that the equipment does not produce any color copies, and generates lines of people to use one of the three functions; District Office needs separate copier, scanner, fax units;
- District Office experienced other purchases of inappropriate equipment (cameras and desk chairs) that were made without staff input;

San Bernardino District Office

- Critical vacancies in office – at one time this office had 13 CSHOs, now down to six;
- CSHOs would like to telecommute as this office covers a large geographic area and people live far from the office; working from home would save time, vehicle fuel and wear and tear;

San Diego District Office

- Need Bilingual (Spanish/English) CSHO in Imperial County to handle work there. There is space allocated to Region III at an EDD office in El Centro that could be used for this purpose. The following statistics are for inspections conducted in Imperial County:
 - FY 2008 – 22 inspections (17 fat/cat)
 - FY 2009 – 53 inspections (14 fat/cat)
 - FY 2010 – 37 inspections (18 fat/cat)
 - FY 2011 – 35 inspections (20 fat/cat)
- CSHOs would like to telecommute as this office covers a large geographic area and people live far from the office; working from home would save time, vehicle fuel and wear and tear;
- Eight CSHOs share three state cars;

San Francisco District Office

- Critical vacancies: two CSHO positions and one admin position;
- CSHOs have to share state vehicles (currently) and DIR has threatened to take all the office’s vehicles;
- DIMS unit is non-functional;

- Only one Spanish-speaking person in office;

Santa Rosa District Office

- Many inter-related issues to office policies, logistical difficulties with Tower Crane unit housed in District Office, other management issues;
- Need electronic date-stamp equipment as one admin staff person has developed a repetitive motion injury from manually “Bates-stamping” large files;

Santa Ana District Office

- Critical vacancy: Office has only one admin staff; CHSOs do a lot of clerical work;

Torrance District Office

- Critical vacancy: District Manager – no DM for almost two years; difficult to integrate and mentor newly hired staff;

Van Nuys District Office

- Critical vacancies: At one time this District Office was three District Offices with 20 CSHOs, six OTs, and three DMs. Current staffing is 12 CSHOs, two OTs, and one DM;
- Limited space in office: Region IV staff and Medical Unit staff are crowded into Van Nuys District Office; Bakersfield and Ventura staff have also been added to this space;
- CSHOs would like to telecommute.;
- Need to open the Bakersfield office officially as soon as possible – three Van Nuys CSHOs live in Bakersfield area and are already using it;
- Van Nuys CSHOs have been assigned PSM work without being trained;

West Covina District Office

- CSHOs would like to telecommute;
- CSHOs use own cars and share state cars; cars are parked at office, but it is not secure;

Region V – Ming & Tunneling offices

Chico M&T Training Unit

- Critical vacancy: Staff cannot keep up with mandated training;

San Bernardino M&T

- This office has limited work but has a staff of one Senior, two clerical, and two Safety Engineers. Some staff members would like to be assigned to other offices for work;

Van Nuys M&T

- The Appeals Board frequently uses the conference room for hearings, but never notifies office when scheduled hearings have been canceled.;

Region VI Offices

Region VI – EEEEC – North

- Numerous issues related to EEEEC unit policies, DOSH implementation of these policies, overtime pay and compensation time off policies, travel policies, and implementation of other management policies related to performance goals and case lapse times;
- Only one admin staff in the unit which means CSHOs do a lot of clerical work.
- No dedicated fax line in the office;
- With travel and overtime policies, it is difficult to hold face-to-face staff meetings and, as a result, difficult to create a cohesive unit;

Region VI – High Hazard Unit – North

- Numerous issues related to performance goals and case lapse times;
- Need better intelligence for programmed inspections – right industries selected, but individual employers and sites is deficient;
- If HHU is to be assigned complaints and accidents as well as programmed inspections, then more resources are need at the district office level;
- Only one admin staff in the unit which generates a lot of paperwork [subsequently lost that admin person and now has no full-time admin staff];
- Need SQL programmer to obtain workers compensation data for better targeting of HHU programmed inspections;

Region VI – High Hazard Unit – South

- The original goal of HHU conducting comprehensive inspections of “high hazard industries” has been lost due to a policy change (to partial inspections) in the last administration – HHU should return to original goals;
- Target list are very poor; generate many “no inspections”. At one time the lists were drawn up from “high hazard industries,” not individual high hazard employers, and the inspections were better and HHU was proactive and more effective;
- IH monitoring in this office has declined because of a change in HHU focus prioritizing partial (rather than comprehensive) inspections, poor target lists, inspection goals and short case lapse times, and obstacles created by Calico;
- Need HHU inspectors in the San Diego area;
- Need official telecommuting policy;

Region VI – Process Safety Management – North

- Only one admin staff in the office;
- Need additional state vehicles as inspections sometimes delayed by schedule conflicts with shared vehicles;

- Unit uses outside expert of failure analysis or related specialized skills, but unstable funding for DOSH has meant lack of key resource on occasion;
- Need one set of implemented policies and procedures for the unit as PSM North and South operate very differently;

Consultation Service

- The consultation program is missing one RM, two area managers, two seniors and a dedicated support staff (DOSH HQ uses most of their time; work is not getting done because of lack of resources;
- Insufficient staff to process applications has resulted in a reduction of participants in recognition programs;

Consultation – Regional Office

- No Regional Manager – more difficult to coordinate, plan and oversee work;

Consultation – Fresno On-site office

- Need barrier at front door to separate public from office;
- Consultants feel they receive less training because of their location – far from Sacramento and Oakland;
- Consultants have difficulties maintaining their professional certifications (CSP, CIH) with the limited space accorded consultants in DOSH trainings;
- Need to make sure that the consultation service’s public information office has the latest information, texts, training and interpretations of Title 8 regs and enforcement policies;

Consultation -- La Palma On-site Office (formerly Santa Fe Springs)

- Consultants telecommute, so the Division needs a telecommuting policy;

Consultation – Oakland On-site office

- No full-time Area Manager for the office;
- Lack of staff meetings has resulted in incomplete information and coordination
- Need computer upgrade and better furniture for OT;
- Not enough cars for field personnel – some field staff are required to use their own car for state business;

Consultation – Sacramento On-site office

- No full-time Area Manager for the office;
- Hard to generate teamwork with vacancies at the Regional Manager and Area Manager levels;
- Need state cars for consultants – so field staff are required to use personal cars for state business;

Consultation – San Diego On-site Office

- Consultants telecommute, so the Division needs a telecommuting policy;
- Need guidelines on motivating and accommodating older workforce

- Share one state car that is parked at office, or drive personal car

Consultation – Van Nuys On-site Office

- Consultants telecommute, so the Division needs a telecommuting policy;
- Six consultants share three cars that are parked at the office, or drive their own cars;

Consultation – VPP/Public Information

- Critical understaffing as two people recently retired and one person resigned – but no replacement hiring possible because of hiring freeze;
- No administrative staff in the Oakland VPP office;
- VPP office in Oakland is small, even for two people;
- Need additional staff because with each new VPP member (now 81 sites), work increases (oversight visits, paperwork) but the number of staff have remained the same;
- DIR travel bans have a negative impact on work;

Consultation – Research & Education office

- Need an in-house graphic designer and lacks advanced computer software for publishing;
- Need better coordination with DOSH leadership over priorities for projects – have 35-40 possible projects;
- Need better phone system;
- Need better office furniture and configuration: no cubicles – all open space, high noise levels, lack of privacy; “hand me down” equipment/furniture;
- no access to kitchen sink and break area [since remedied by sharing with other suite];